The Founding and the Constitution of Revolutionary America

From Confederacy to Federalism
Ch. 2
I AM NOT A WITCH.

I'M NOTHING YOU'VE HEARD.

I SUPPORT THE CONSTITUTION

EXCEPT THE PARTS I DON'T AGREE WITH

OR DON'T KNOW ABOUT...

I'M YOU.
The Setup

- What kinds of choices did the colonists have to make when a revolution was becoming real?
- Select 3 choices and discuss
The founding of the nation involved choices & in fact reflected “study of political choices”

- Political, Economic, Question of allegiance to Crown ? Religion?
- Groups included loyalists, revolutionaries & those in the middle. Who else?
- Personal choices? Anglican Church – who would it show allegiance to?
Group Activity

- Divide class 3 ways
- Loyalists
- Revolutionaries
- Undecided
  - Define what your label means to you
  - Choose an economic/social/political class to which your group might belong
  - What would be your personal interests at stake?
  - Address the question of trust and distrusts
  - What were some of the reasons to oppose/support the abolition of slavery at the time of ratification?
  - Risks? Outright war, invasions, economic insecurity,
  - Some might have become Canadians!
  - What about international recognition?
What is a constitution?

- What purpose does it serve?
- Defines the relationship between citizen & the Gov
- Interest in creating effective gov
- Supreme law of the land
First constitution & Declaration of Independence came into being as a result of:

- Conflicts between Britain & Colonies
- Conflicts among competing groups within the colonies

List single major reason for the discontent in the colonies
Colonists signing Declaration of Independence
Quick Highlights & Summary

1776-1777 Articles of Confederation
- First Constitution, was adopted in 1777
- Under this arrangement, the central gov had little powers while the states retained significant powers
- As a result, 2nd founding, the Constitution was introduced in 1787

Purpose
- To grant more powers to the Central gov
- Promote commerce
- Protect property from the state legislatures
Purpose cont’d

- Established mechanism which would provide opportunity for popular consent for new governments
- New government would not threaten property rights & liberty
- Why was property right so important?
Several of the founding fathers were also slave owners
Slaves were considered properties
Political /Historical backdrop:
Colonies as they existed before Independence

- Early settlers were a diverse bunch:
  - Those looking for freedom from religious oppression
  - Those escaping debts
  - Others wishing to make money for their families back home
  - Still others who came as free persons
  - Those as indentured servants
  - Others were escaping criminal past

- Few came with the idea of establishing self-government in the new world
1607: Settlers of Jamestown established first representative assembly in America.

1620: Pilgrims who arrived at Plymouth, Mass. drew up the *Mayflower Compact*

Dedicated themselves to some kind of “civil body politick” in the presence of God & one another.
Great distance between the Crown colonies led to some sort of autonomy which soon led to conflict with Great Britain.

Served in the interests of the soon to break away colonies.

1774: Colonies established the Continental Congress to organize their efforts towards self gov.

1776: Conflict between Crown & colonies grew & in 1776 the Congress adopted the Declaration of Independence.
Six years of war ensued; Britain surrendered

- **1781**: Continental Congress introduced & ratified the *first* constitution, even before the war ended.
- *Articles of Confederation* formed among the states. Called a “league of friendship”.
- Permitted each state to retain its “sovereignty” & “independence”.
- Very early on then we see the supremacy of the states over the central gov.
Poor Economic conditions in Britain led to higher taxes & tariffs in colonies
Crown felt that the colonies were not paying their fair share to maintain & defend them
Groups in the colonies included:
1. New England Merchants
2. Southern Planters
3. “Royalists” holders of royal lands, licenses/patents
4. Shopkeepers, artisans & laborers
5. Small Farmers
Group Activity

- Divide class 3 ways
- Loyalists
- Revolutionaries
- Undecided
  - Define what your label means to you
  - Choose an economic/social/political class to which your group might belong
  - What would be your personal interests at stake?
  - Address the question of trust and distrusts
  - What were some of the reasons to oppose/support the abolition of slavery at the time of ratification?
  - Risks? Outright war, invasions, economic insecurity,
  - Some might have become Canadians!
  - What about international recognition?
Shifting political influences

- “Radical forces” of the shopkeepers & laborers began to gain political strength
- 1760’s - Stamp Act, Sugar Acts resulted in strong opposition from the Southern Planters & New England merchants who began splitting away from the other elite groups
- They sought support from shopkeepers, laborers, artisans
Competing interests among the groups

- Resulted in organized demonstrations & boycott of British imports
- Successful in forcing British to rescind their taxes
- Having won their day, this group (Southern Planters & NE Merchants) returned to supporting the Crown
- Also supported British soldiers during upheavals of the Boston Massacre
But the new found strength of the shop keepers, artisans, laborers, small farmers became a real threat to the elites as well as the crown.

Samuel Adams took up the cause of the radicals

Radicals claimed that the British supported an unjust social & political structure in the colonies
Boston Tea Party 1773

- Colonial merchants felt disenfranchised & began agitating against Britain
- Aggravated when British gov granted an export monopoly of tea to the East India Co, 1773
- Boston Tea Party led to even stricter reactions from Britain which further alienated & radicalized the colonists
- Resulted in assembly of delegates from all parts of the colonies - First Continental Congress - 1774
- That led to Declaration of Independence
2nd Continental Congress appointed reps from across the colonies to draft a declaration of Independence

Members included:

- Thomas Jefferson, Benjamin Franklin, Roger Sherman, John Adams & Robert Livingston
- Jefferson drafted the Declaration of Independence, famous for its call for something called “unalienable rights”
- Advocated life, liberty & pursuit of happiness which could not be curtailed by gov
- Appeared to appeal to sense of national unity
Challenges facing National Gov under new arrangement

- Articles of Confederation established a Congress – a legislative body with 1 house in which each state had 1 representative
- No executive of judicial branch
- Congress was very limited in its powers
- Leader feared granting too much powers to a central authority based on their own experience with a colonial authority
Challenges

- Concerned about their liberty & independence, hence a decentralized form of gov was devised.
- Society largely agrarian which suffered a depression after the war of independence.
- They felt that they could obtain support from the state gov instead of a distant central gov.
- Citizens identified more with their local states.
Conflicts: Agrarian vs. Business elites

- Bankers, manufacturers, merchants were unhappy with Articles of Confederation
- Planned on a commercial empire instead of an agrarian society
- They envisioned national & international trade
- Required national laws, stable currency, credit, banking systems, system of debt collection, etc.
- Needed a strong central gov which would safeguard them against debtors
Absence of military

- After the war, military was disbanded
- No military to protect against hostile forces
- Britain maintained forces in Midwest & Canada
- Spain occupied California & Florida & controlled the Mississippi River, hence movements & trade
- North African pirates (Barbary pirates – Tunisia, Morocco, Libya) posed significant threat on the high seas
- Estimated that there were over 1 million sailors captured
Congress could not raise monies for an army, nor could it draft individuals directly.
Congress was subservient to the states & they were not always sympathetic to its demands.
Without an army, Congress could not force the British military out, or assert its movements along the Mississippi River.
The Articles of Confederation did not provide means to deal with foreign threats or domestic crises.
Congress could not directly impose or collect taxes.
The hands of Congress were tied in several ways.
After declaring independence, the Continental Congress adopted the Articles of **Confederation & Perpetual Union**

- Basis of America’s national government until 1789
- Led to a **confederate** form of gov. How was it defined?
- Little power to central gov- Congress
- Congress comprised of reps. from the states, which paid their salaries & could recall them at will
- No president at that time
- Constitution was signed by 39 of the 55 delegates on September 17, 1787
- 2nd Founding: from Compromise (1777-1781) to Constitution 1787
- Temporary unity was secured
- Gov could focus on commerce, protecting property rights, promote the constitution
Agreement led to

- Bicameralism – Congress comprises of 2 houses/chambers
- Checks & balances: e.g. Prez Veto power, Senate to approve presidential appointments
- Electoral College:
  - President elected by electors (instead of directly by voters) from each state who meet after general election to cast ballot for prez.
- Bill of rights (First 10 amendments to constitution ratified in 1791)
Federalism introduced

- System of gov in which power is divided between central & regional gov
- How is it different from a confederate form of gov?
The 7 articles of the Constitution 1791

- Legislative Branch: 2 chambers
- Executive Branch: President
- Judicial Branch: The Courts
- National Unity & Power
- Amending the Constitution
- National Supremacy
- Ratification
Legislative Branch, now Bicameral

Article 1 of the Constitution

- Congress: House of Reps
  - Directly elected every 2 years/Responsible to the people
  - Responsible for tax collection, commerce, declaration of war, maintaining navy & military

- Senate (initially elected by House of Reps)
  - Changed by 17th Amendment in 1913
  - Voted directly by people for 6 year terms
  - Staggered terms
  - Senate approves Prez’s appointments, ratifies treaties
The Executive Branch

Article 2 of the Constitution

- Introduced office of Presidency/Commander-in-Chief
- Framers wanted an executive who would not be hampered by voters or the checks & balances of the three branches of gov
- Limited to 2 four year terms (introduced later), & would:
  - Recognize other countries
  - Negotiate treaties
  - Grants pardons
  - Convenes Congress in special sessions
  - Veto rights over Congressional bills
The Judicial Branch

Article 3 of the Constitution

- Created the highest court of the land,
- Supreme Court justices are life time appointments
- Appointed by the Prez. & approval of the Senate
- Power to resolve disputes between federal & state laws
- Interpret laws of the land
Judiciary cont’d.

- Reviews Lower courts’ decisions
- Determine whether power belongs to central gov or state gov
- Rule on controversies between citizens & states
- Nothing on judicial reviews in the constitution, i.e., the power of the court to render decisions of legislative and executive branch unconstitutional
National Unity Power
Article 4, referred to as Full Faith & Credit Clause

- Each state is obliged to honor certain decisions made in other states: e.g. Marriage
- Privileges & Immunity Clause aka Comity Clause
  - A state cannot discriminate against citizens from another state, or grant more privileges to its own citizens
  - Guarantee of reciprocity among states: each state to give faith to official acts of other state
  - No matter which state you are in your rights are guaranteed the same as every other American
Supremacy Clause

Article 6

- Laws passed by the national gov are superior over those of any state
27 amendments to date, 10 being the original Bill of Rights
Not easily accomplished
Requires 2/3 approval by Congress, &
Ratification by ¾ of the states
9 of the 13 founding states would need to ratify
Constitutional limits on national Gov power

- Constitution assigns power to national gov as well as to safeguard & restrain those powers

Three limitations:

- **a) Federalism:** Created 2 sovereign powers: the states & the nation, with greater power assigned to the national gov

- **b) Separation of Powers:** Power is balanced between 3 branches- check & Balances
  - Each branch is assigned power, but the constitution assigns some of the powers of each to the other

- **c) Bill of Rights:** First 10 amendments to the Constitution were adopted to limit national power & protect citizens
Fight for Ratification was a fight between two camps: Federalists & Anti-federalists

**Federalists**
- Supported the Constitution at 1787 Convention
- More nationalists who wanted a strong national gov

**Anti-Federalists**
- Opposed the Constitution at the Convention
- Wanted a federal gov with more decentralized powers

A time of great debates - opposing principles & philosophies
- Feds: individuals like James Madison, Alexander Hamilton
- Anti Feds: Robert Yates
They disagreed on the following:
Issue of Representation

- Anti-feds wanted reps which reflected “true picture of the people”
- Feds argued that the reps don’t have to be exactly like those represented
  - That they should have superior qualifications to the people-elitist approach.
  - Similar discussions continue today
Issues of Tyranny of the Majority

- Feds recognized the risk of tyranny by the majority
- Anti-feds argued against tyranny by the few over the majority
Each side agreed that there should be limited powers of the gov

Feds supported broad powers by the national gov to protect the people & believed that the Constitution had sufficient checks on such powers

Anti-feds felt that the national gov was given too much powers over states & people & wanted those powers to be enumerated

Anti feds wanted a bill of rights to place limits on gov power

Feds rejected it
Feds more or less won the day, but they had to adopt the Bill of Rights to limit gov powers

Bill of Rights were introduced by James Madison
Under Confederation it soon became clear that congressional powers were not strong enough to maintain national unity.
Confederation was not recognized internationally.
Colonies were not capable of defending themselves from external threats.
Virginia legislature invited other states to address weakness of the confederate gov.
5 States met in Annapolis Convention (Maryland) 1786 & decision was made to pursue constitutional revisions.
Planned to meet in Philadelphia 1787.
Continuing instability resulted in the Second Founding
Marriage of philosophical principles & interests
Resolve to protect property rights
Critical Factors

i. Anti Federalists vs. Federalists

- Struggles between Anti-federalists who felt that too much powers were being given to the new gov &,
- **Federalists** who supported the constitution & wanted its ratification
- America was a colony under Britain & its struggle to separate from Britain was reflected in the ratification of the American Constitution of 1787
- George Washington, considered the father of the country, was assigned the task of presiding the 1787 Constitutional Convention in Philadelphia
- Other remarkable Americans such as Benjamin Franklin were in attendance & lent credibility
Constitution proved to be enduring & a model for the rest of the world

Constitution was a process of bargaining & compromises. This tradition still continues today

While many Americans today look towards the Constitution & founding fathers with much respect & reverence, there were also a lot of self-interests at work
ii. Shay’s Rebellion 1787

- Resulted in need by states to push for the Philadelphia Convention
  - Daniel Shay led a rebellion of farmers against gov of Massachusetts because their farms were threatened with foreclosures
iii. Liberty, Equality & Democracy

These important ideals were also competing values:

- Too much equality & democracy might mean sweeping changes in society
- Remember that slavery was very much accepted as legal & societal practices
- Competing struggles between different interests in the colonies- economic, political & between the 5 interest groups:
  - New England merchants
  - Southern Planters
  - The “Royalists”- holders of land, titles and business licenses
  - Shopkeepers, laborers & craftsmen
  - Small farmers
Whose voices were missing?
- Women, slaves, First nations people
- Major concerns included taxation, trade & commerce between the groups, but there was unity amongst the Southern planters, New England merchants & Patent holders
- These considered themselves the “elites” of the colonies

Define “elite”
Elites

- Class or group of people who are separated by social, economic & political status, hence considered a superior class
- They were in direct opposition to the shopkeepers, laborers & small farmers

- Are there elites in America?
The Great Compromise:

Randolph of Virginia & the Virginia Plan
Vs
Peterson of New Jersey
Great Compromise

- Randolph proposed new gov with representation to the national legislature based on population of each state. Would result in unequal representation & give advantages to larger states.
- Peterson of New Jersey & the New Jersey plan proposed equal representation by the states, regardless of their population.
- Feelings of opposition on both sides were heated and could have led to a dissolution of the confederation.
Great Compromise

- Prominent figure such as James Madison of Virginia, had studied the gov of other countries, drafted a plan which set the dominant tone
- He became known as the father of the American Constitution
- Despite disagreements, they agreed that the gov would be a republic form of gov which would derive its powers from the people it represents, & accountable to the people
- An indirect democracy in which some of the representatives are directly voted
Great Compromise

- They agreed that the national gov should be stronger, but with certain checks & limitations.
- They decided that the national gov would consist of 3 branches:
  - A legislative
  - Executive &
  - Judicial
  - Each granted separate powers.
Unresolved areas

- Other areas of contention remained:
  - Representation
  - Slavery
  - Trade & Taxation
Congress / legislature would consist of 2 houses: Bicameral

- House of reps. based on population of each state
- Senate in which each state would have 2 reps regardless of size
The Great Compromise & 3/5th Compromise

- Staved off continued rivalry between N & S states
- Question of Slavery was one of the single most challenging conflicts & had to be resolved if the Constitution was to be ratified
- Greatest Compromise: North conceded much to the South so as to gain control over shipping & commerce
- The 3/5th Compromise: 5 slaves would count as 3 in order to calculate the state’s representation in Congress. Each slave would be counted as 3/5 of a person
Why was the question of slaves important?

- Dominant slave states? Georgia, NC, SC, Maryland, Virginia.
- 3/5th Compromise actually institutionalized slavery
  - In several slave owning states the pop. of the slaves outnumbered the non-slave pop,
  - Also the early divisions between North & South were becoming evident- division based on geography
  - This compromise gave the Southern states more representations in the House of Representative & a upper hand in selection of president
  - By 1860 9 of the 15 presidents were slave owner
- Also put in place was the “Retrieve Fugitive clause”
Trade & Taxation

- This too hinged on the issue of slavery & the North vs. the South
- North sought protection for their businesses by seeking taxes on imported & exported goods
- South opposed taxes on exports because it would leave them uncompetitive
- Agreement that only imported goods would be taxed
- Later this would be a big issue in the civil war
Features of the Constitution: Republic

- Distinction between Republic & a direct Democracy
- Founders chose a *republic* form of gov which was an indirect democracy
- Permits citizens to vote for representatives who make decisions/policies
- Founders felt that a direct democracy could not sustain itself in a diverse & large country
- Introduced the concept of the Electoral College whereby the president is elected by reps of the people
- Founders distrusted mass popularity as a means of good gov
Features of the Constitution: Fragmentation of Power

- Founders believed that while they concentrated the powers of the national gov, they had to place checks/limitations on those powers.
- They felt that human nature was prompted by greed, selfishness & lust for power.
- Hence they fragmented powers by introducing:
  - Federalism as opposed to a unitary state
  - Separation of powers
  - Checks & balances
Federalism: shared power between central & state gov

- Many countries at that time were designed along a unitary system of gov
- At the time of the Article of Confederation the arrangement was a confederate which granted considerable powers to the state gov
- Founders under new arrangement wanted to balance the powers
- Granted each state 2 Senators regardless of size or population
- This was also an effort to balance powers between the states & protect the smaller states from being overwhelmed/bullied by the larger ones
At national level the separation of powers was introduced by the creation of 3 branches:
- Legislative
- Executive &
- Judiciary

Unlike the parliamentary system of modern democracies, no clear separation of powers
- The exec & judiciary branches are drawn from the legislative

Initially
- House Reps were directly elected by the people
- Senators appointed were by the State legislators
- Electoral College selected by the states
- Electoral College elected the president
- Judges appointed by the president for life
17th Amendment altered the following;

- Senators to be elected by people
- Electors of the Electoral College to be elected by the people
- Office terms were staggered

Much of this is credited to Madison’s concept of separation of powers
Another feature introduced by Madison’s concept was **Checks & Balances**

- Separate powers but competing powers
- Eg. Congress makes laws, but President can veto
- The court can rule the decision unconstitutional
- Senate can reject President’s appointments
- While each branch has its sphere of powers, the other branches have powers to step into the sphere of the other
Undemocratic Features

- Constitutional agreements left several unresolved issues which would need to be sorted out by later governments & Americans
  - Question of slavery
  - Right to vote for certain segments of society. Who were they?
  - Popular vote can be ignored when selecting a president
  - Disproportionate powers to small state by granting 2 senate seats to every state, regardless of size
The new immigrants to America were diverse & came for different reasons. But the majority opposed too much gov presence in their lives. Several opposed gov because it meant higher taxes on their profits.
Philosophical ideas which influenced Founders

- Founders were highly educated men & shared ideals from the Enlightenment period which emphasized reason & debates above religious arguments to resolve conflicts.
- Conversant with reasons for gov failures in other societies as well as having a global awareness- mostly sense of European societies, which they considered as civilized.
- **John Locke**, British philosopher who argues that every citizen has *natural rights* vested by God influenced the Founders’ thinking.
- One of those rights is right to property, an idea which appealed to many because they saw a opportunity to grow their own wealth.
Another idea that Locke put forward dealt with people coming together to form a gov through a social contract which would provide limited gov

Role of gov was to provide protection of its people but not to become so strong as to threaten their rights

Locke also believed in majority rule

Charles de Montesquieu, a French philosopher, influenced the debates with his refined concept of separation of powers

Newton also influenced the process with his mechanical ideas of each part having a different function, but each also required to balance each other; hence checks & balances
Political Ideas

- Founders might have been intellectuals & impressed by European philosophers, but they were also shrewd & seasoned politicians
- Had to sell to their respective states their agreements so they negotiated & made compromises, etc.
- 8 had signed the Declaration of Independence
- 39 had served in Congress
- 7 had been governors
Many were also part of the elite class & wanted to protect other elites whom they represented

Included shippers, manufacturers, planters, property owners, lawyers

Only 1 farmer was in the lot

So property protection & increase personal wealth were foremost on their minds

They were fearful of populism; that too much democracy would put pressure on gov to tax the wealthy & share with less wealthy

In the end the 3 factors: Philosophy, Political & Economic influences were all forces which influenced the process
The Framers were aware of the possible oppositions from different states & segments of society which perceived a power shift in favor to the national gov.

Hence they astutely introduced languages such as *Federalists & Anti-Federalists* describing those who supported & who opposed the new arrangements.
Changing the Constitution

- Although the Framers expected that the Constitution would last, they recognized that there may be need for amendments.
- They introduced mechanisms for change.
- The Citizen’s Role & the Changing Constitution:
  - Difficult to amend.
Over 200 years

- Between 1789-1996, of the 11000 submitted, only 27 were ratified
- Madison proposed 12 of which 10 were ratified in 1791
- Only 15 adopted since 1791 & since Civil War 1868
- 27 amendments to date (10 of which were the original 1st. Amendment introduced by Madison in 1789)
Ways to amend?

i) Formally by amendment
ii) Informally by judicial interpretation
iii) Political practice
By Amendment

- Not easy to accomplish
- Requires 2/3 approval by Congress & Senate
- Ratification by ¾ of the states

One exception: the case of equal Rights Amendment ERA 1971

- Received 2/3 majority by the House but did not receive ratification by 38 states
Bill of Rights: First Amendment proposed by Madison

- 1st. Freedom of speech, press, assembly, & religion
- 2nd. Right to bear arms to form a militia
- 3rd. Right not to have soldier quartered in one’s home during peace time
- 4th. Protection against unreasonable searches & seizures (those accused of crimes)
- 5th. Protection against self-incrimination & guarantee to due process of law
- 6th. Right to counsel & jury in criminal cases
- 7th. Right to jury trial civil cases
- 8th. Protection against excessive fines, bails & unusual punishment
- 9th. Granting powers beyond those listed above
- 10th. Reserving powers to states not granted the national govt.

Last (introduced by Madison in 1789 with no time limits) & 27 Amendment was ratified in 1992 by Michigan
Amendment by Judicial Measure

- Judicial Branch steps in when:
  - Disputes arise &
  - When interpretations are required

Hence this branch can informally introduce changes to the Constitution
Two historical events which significantly transformed the Constitution are:

- **Great Depression in 1929**
- **New Deal 1933**

These 2 events introduced the national government in a more pervasive way & increased its powers over the states significantly.

- Initiatives by FDR to improve economy & relieve harsh consequence of a failing economy.
- Introduced sweeping initiatives, NEW DEAL, which strengthened the hands of the national government.
Initially several legislations were reversed by supreme court, but after FDR’s popular re-election in 1936, court did an about face. This paved the way for major changes to the constitution without going the formal Amendment routes. Gave national gov right to regulate businesses. Federal bureaucracy expanded across the country as national gov opened employments to citizen.
Conclusion

- US has the oldest Republic, oldest democracy & oldest system of federalism
- It’s features:
  - A structure of gov with separation of powers
  - Checks & balances
  - Indirect president election provide for a complex form of gov
- Voters can elect some representatives, but not all

At the time of founding several areas were left for future gov to resolve:
  - Slavery
  - Women’s rights
Conclusion

- Fragmented powers so that a single group cannot control entire gov;
  - Exceptions seen during Vietnam & Iraq wars
- Overlapping of powers permits each branch to act on any issue (no one branch monopolizes)
- This advantage also can cause one branch to be obstructive
- System works best by consensus & compromise
- Risk of things moving slowly
What do you understand by Confederation?

- An arrangement whereby certain limited powers are assigned to the national gov
- States retain sovereignty rights over their affairs, except for powers delegated to national gov
- What powers were vested in the Congress?
Key Terms

- Bicameral
- Articles of Confederation
- Bill of Rights
- Checks & Balances
- Electoral College
- Great Compromise
- 3/5 th. Compromise
- Shay’s Rebellion
- Supremacy Clause
- Second Founding
- Amendment